IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1617/2023

MUKESH KUMAR MEENA & ORS. ...Appellant(s)

VERSUS

DHARMENDRA KUMAR BHINCHAR & ORS. ...Respondent(s)

WITH

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1620/2023

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1618-1619/2023

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1714/2023

T.C.(C) No. 44/2025

O R D E R

CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1617/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1620/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1618-1619/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s). 1714/2023 and T.C.(C) No. 44/2025:

Application for amendment in Cause Title is allowed in T.C.(C) NO. 44/2025.

Applications for intervention/impleadment are allowed in respective Civil Appeals.

2. The appellants herein are having bachelor degrees with English language not as an optional subject but as an additional subject. The State Government, by its policy decision dated 28.07.2022 have treated them as ineligible for appointment to the post of teacher Grade-III (Level-II) which has given rise to the present proceedings. Since the State Government, at the relevant time (before 28.07.2022), accepted

the said qualification holding them eligible for recruitment and promotion, the writ petitions were preferred by the degree-holders with optional subjects and the said writ petitions have been allowed by the learned Single Judge and affirmed by the Division Bench of the High Court.

3. During the pendency of these Civil Appeals, the State of Rajasthan has filed an affidavit making statement for disposal of the Civil Appeals concerning such candidates, who were in service prior to the new policy dated 28.07.2022, either in respect of recruitment or in respect of promotion. The following has been stated in paragraph Nos.8, 9, 10 and 11 of the affidavit dated 10.09.2025 which read as under:

> **"8. It is respectfully submitted that in the year 2022, the State of Rajasthan consciously adopted a policy decision that candidates holding an additional degree shall not be treated as eligible for appointment to the post of Teacher Grade-III (Level-II|). That the State Government do not accept additional subject qualification for teachers' recruitment as it is not a mere degree which is required, we need subject experts who have gone through the language in all 3 years after rigorously pursuing it as an optional subject in all 3 years.**
>
> **9. That in the interest of justice and overall facts of the cases and in order to resolve the issues pending before this Hon'ble Court, the State will not remove all those persons (declared eligible on account of their additional degree) who have appointed and teaching under the Impugned recruitment notification. The State Government will also give them the promotion in accordance with applicable laws. Accordingly, the State Government is not contesting the Civil appeal No.1620/2023 filed by it against the judgments passed by the Ld. Single Judge and Hon'ble Division Bench.**
>
> **10. That further, in order to safeguard the rights of candidates who had studied English as an optional subject consistently throughout all three years of their graduation, the State shall secure their appointments by creating supernumerarv posts. This step shall be taken to ensure that such candidates do not suffer any prejudice on account of the dispute that has arisen with respect to optional and additional degree holders.**
>
> **11. That in light of the foregoing, it is most**

> **respectfully prayed that the present Special Leave Petitions may kindly be disposed of in the above terms, while allowing the State to do the needful within 3 months as stated above for giving a quietus to the whole dispute in the interest of all the contesting parties."**

4. In view of the above statement made in the affidavit submitted by the State of Rajasthan, we dispose of these Civil Appeals and Transferred Case in terms of the affidavit. It is made clear that such of the parties involved in these matters, who were in service on or before 28.07.2022, shall be governed by the undertaking of the State Government in the above affidavit and the benefit enuring to them on such statement shall be extended to them at the earliest. It is ordered accordingly.

5. Pending application(s), if any, shall stand disposed of.

……J.
(PRASHANT KUMAR MISHRA)

……J.
(SHREE CHANDRASHEKHAR)

NEW DELHI;
NOVEMBER 19, 2026.

ITEM NO.101 COURT NO.11 SECTION XV

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1617/2023

MUKESH KUMAR MEENA & ORS. Appellant(s)

VERSUS

DHARMENDRA KUMAR BHINCHAR & ORS. Respondent(s)

**(IA No. 85398/2025 - EARLY HEARING APPLICATION
IA No. 112136/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
IA No. 191644/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 153224/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 112137/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 44229/2023 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 191642/2022 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES
IA No. 184610/2022 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES
IA No. 232208/2025 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES
IA No. 41649/2023 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)**

**WITH
C.A. No. 1620/2023 (XV)
(IA No. 75121/2024 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS
IA No. 146378/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 114594/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 255718/2024 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT
IA No. 255723/2024 - VACATING STAY
I.A. NO.146376/2021-APPL. FOR IMPLEADMENT
I.A NO.2175/2022-APPL. FOR IMPLEADMENT
I.A. NO.137705/2026-APPL. FOR IMPLEADMENT)**

**C.A. No. 1618-1619/2023 (XV)
(IA No. 114389/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
IA No. 114388/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 247830/2024 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)**

**C.A. No. 1714/2023 (XV)
(FOR PERMISSION TO FILE PETITION (SLP/TP/WP/..) ON IA 28964/2022 FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT ON IA 28965/2022)**

C.A. No. 1611-1612/2023 (XIV-A)
(IA No. 36350/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT)

C.A. No. 1621/2023 (XV)
(IA No. 203260/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
IA No. 203261/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 106998/2023 - MODIFICATION OF COURT ORDER)

T.C.(C) No. 4/2023 (XV)
(IA No. 216009/2025 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

C.A. No. 9713-9715/2026 (XV)
(IA No. 148077/2026 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS
IA No. 171244/2025 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 179502/2026 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT
IA No. 171243/2025 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES
IA No. 79101/2025 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

SLP(C) No. 14212-14214/2025 (XV)
(IA No. 29586/2026 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS
IA No. 115642/2025 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 279119/2025 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

T.C.(C) No. 44/2025 (XV)
(IA No. 82269/2026 - AMENDMENT IN CAUSE TITLE
IA No. 82181/2026 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

C.A. No. 12456/2026 (XV)
(IA No. 251717/2026 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING
IA No. 251718/2026 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
IA No. 251719/2026 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 251721/2026 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

Date : 19-11-2026 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE PRASHANT KUMAR MISHRA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SHREE CHANDRASHEKHAR

For Appellant(s) : Mr. Anurag- 2769, AOR
Mr. Dheeraj Jani, Adv.
Mr. Divyansh Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Pratibha Jain- 518, AOR
Mr. Puneet Jain, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Akriti Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Akshit Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Om Sudhir Vidyarthi, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Jain, Adv.
Mr. Bhavya Singh Naruka, Adv.
Mr. Yogit Kamat, Adv.
Mr. Aarsh Ozha, Adv.

Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Amit Agrawal- 2470, AOR
Mr. Akshit Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Aditi Vats, Adv.
Mr. Nakul Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Wadhwa, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Jaswal- 2955, AOR

Mr. Amit Pawan- 1539, AOR

By Courts Motion, AOR

Mr. Ranjit Kumar Sharma- 2205, AOR
Mr. Ranjit Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Anuj Bhandari- 2175, AOR

Mr. Chandan Malav, Adv.
Ms. Astha Singh, AOR
Ms. Gauri Soni, Adv.
Ms. Palak Mathur, Adv.

Mr. Pallav Shishodia, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Manan Shishodia, Adv.
Mr. Ghanshyam Joshi- 1175, AOR

Mr. Mandeep Kalra- 3242 , AOR
Mr. Niteen Kumar Sinha- 3262, AOR
Ms. Shalini Chandra- 1969, AOR

For Respondent(s) **Mr. Praveen Mishra, Adv.**
Mr. Anjani Kumar Mishra, AOR
Mrs. Hardeep Kaur Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Siddhant Gupta, Adv.
Dr. P.N. Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Gyanendra Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Sudhir Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. B.P. Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Jaswal- 2955, AOR
Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha- 2396, AOR

Ms. Swati Ghildiyal, AOR
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Aditi Agarwal, Adv.

Ms. Manisha T Karia, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Geetanjali Mohan, AOR
Ms. Ananya Arora, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Saumya Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Deepin Deepak Sahni, Adv.
Mr. Varun Khetwani, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Navale, Adv.
Mr. Arth Arora, Adv.
Mr. Kshitiz, Adv.

Mr. Niteen Kumar Sinha- 3262, AOR

Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G.
Mr. Saurabh Rajpal- 3577, AOR
Ms. Arushi Rathore, Adv.

Mr. Amit Agrawal- 2470, AOR

Ms. Christi Jain- 2313, AOR
Mr. Puneet Jain, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Akriti Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Akshit Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Om Sudhir Vidyarthi, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Jain, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Jain, Adv.
Ms. Bhavya Singh Naruka, Adv.
Mr. Aarsh Ozha, Adv.

Mr. Anurag- 2769, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Parikh, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Kritika, Adv.
Mr. Ritwik Parikh, Adv.
Mr. Satwik Parikh, Adv.
Mr. Rajat K. Mittal, Adv.
Ms. Bushra Parveen- 2804, AOR

Mr. Mandeep Kalra- 3242, AOR
Ms. Chitrangada Singh, Adv.
Mr. Yashas J, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Paras Mohan Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Gaur, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR
Mr. Aditya Jain, Adv.
Ms. Sakshi Singh, Adv.

Mr. Chandan Malav, Adv.
Ms. Astha Singh- 3907, AOR
Ms. Gauri Soni, Adv.
Ms. Palak Mathur, Adv.

Dr. Surender Singh Hooda- 2261, AOR

Mr. Surya Kant, AOR
Ms. Priyanka Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Chand Qureshi, AOR
Mr. Sanjay Gyan, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Mohod, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Sundeep Pandhi, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep Mohod, Adv.
Mr. Chandan Kumar Mandal, Adv.
Mr. Jay May Kumar, Adv.
Dr. Prabal Jyoti, Adv.

Mr. Anjani Kumar Mishra- 1874, AOR
Ms. Nidhi Tripathi, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1617/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1620/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s).1618-1619/2023, CIVIL APPEAL No(s). 1714/2023 and T.C.(C) No. 44/2025: (Item Nos.101, 101.1, 101.2, 101.3, 101.9)

Application for amendment in Cause Title is allowed in T.C.(C) NO.44/2025.

Applications for intervention/impleadment are allowed in respective Civil Appeals.

The Civil Appeals and Transferred Case are disposed of in terms of the signed order which is placed on the file.

Pending application(s), if any, shall also stand disposed of.

CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 1611-1612/2023:(Item No.101.4)

The matters are de-tagged from C.A. No.1617/2023 and are posted separately on 12.01.2027.

C.A.No.1621/2023, T.C.(C) No.4/2023, C.A.No(s). 9713-9715/2026, SLP(C) No(s).14212-14214/2025 and C.A. No. 12456/2026: (Item Nos.101.5, 101.6, 101.7 and 101.8 and 101.10)

The matters will retain their position.

(RADHA SHARMA)
ASTT. REGISTRAR-cum-PS

(ANU BHALLA)
COURT MASTER (NSH)